

## BOOK REVIEWS

*American Indian Culture and Research Journal* Vol. 10, No. 2.:  
Special Issue: American Indian Governments in the Reagan  
Era, Los Angeles: University of California, 1986. ISBN 0161-  
6463, 94 Pages, \$15 per single issue.

This special issue is a series of five articles which are of particular interest to Canadian scholars because of the parallels which can be drawn between the American and Canadian political situations. Is Brian Mulroney's Meech Lake Accord a clone of Reagan's "New Federalism"? Funding cutbacks and emphases on privatization are characteristic of policies in both countries. One wonders whether Brian Mulroney would agree with Ronald Reagan's assessment of reservations during the Moscow Summit as errors in policy which permits Indians to continue to live in primitiveness. The issues are very real; the overdependence on government funding by Indians in both countries, the lack of government policies to promote true economic independence, and nagging questions about whether these governments really care about Indians at all. It could be argued that developments in Canada under the Meech Lake Accord will be even more ominous than Reagan's New Federalism. A recent book edited by J. Anthony and Menno Boldt, *Governments in Conflict? Provinces and Indian Nations in Canada* (1988) would be good complementary reading. The following are brief abstracts of the five articles in this series:

Jorgensen, J.G. (University of California, Irvine): *Federal Policies, American Indian Policies and the New Federalism*.

President Ronald Reagan's policy of "New Federalism" has ushered in a dramatic change in federal-Indian relations characterized by extensive slashing of Bureau of Indian Affairs budgets combined with the unleashing of the forces of private enterprise on Indian reservations. The BIA's 1987 budget of \$923,000,000 is \$68,000,000 less than in 1986, and the 1986 budget was down \$62,000,000 from 1985. Further, \$340,000,000 of the 1987 budget is no longer assured funding for education, services and economic development, and now has to be contacted by Indian governments. The National Tribal Chairman's Association has criticized the budget cuts as rendering the Bureau of Indian Affairs into an "almost useless" agency. On the other hand, acting on the premise that economics is the driving force behind society, the U.S. government has crippled the abilities of tribal governments to interfere with the development of private enterprise on the reservations. With no increase in federal assistance to aspiring private entrepreneurs, however, the "New Federalism" has had little impact on improving the economies of the reservations and instead has wreaked havoc

by savage cutbacks in social programs.

Clemmer, R.O. (University of Denver): *Hopis, Western Shoshones, and Southern Utes: Three Different Responses to the Indian Reorganization Act of 1934.*

The Indian Reorganization Act was initially intended to bring about economic rehabilitation, Indian self-management, greater Indian civil and cultural freedom and bilateral Indian-U.S. relations. Case studies of the Hopi, Western Shoshone and Southern Utes showed mixed results. The only success story is among the Southern Ute where the Tribal Council devises a successful investment strategy. In the case of the Hopi, the only beneficiaries of the policies were non-Indian oil companies. Among the Western Shoshone, the Act dashed hopes of establishing an adequate land and economic base. The Indian Reorganization Act proved to be idealistic and unrealistic. It resulted in unnecessary social division and economic unravelling on Indian reservations.

Stull, D.D.; Schultz, J.A.; and Cadue, K. Sr. (University of Kansas): *Rights Without Resources: The Rise and Fall of the Kansas Kickapoo.*

Stimulated by liberal government funding for programs to promote Indian self-determination, the Kickapoo became adept at exploiting government resources for community and economic development. Programs and buildings were often created on the basis of the availability of funding rather than on real need. The creation of new jobs lured many Indians to return after having lived in cities for lengthy periods. Amidst this growth, reservation efforts to build a self-sustaining economy failed for various reasons including government as well as tribal obstacles. Such was the rise of the Kickapoo. The advent of the Reagan era and slashing of government funding brought about the fall of the Kickapoo. Much of the prosperity had been illusory since it was dependent upon government funding. Once the funding vanished, the prosperity collapsed like a house of cards. The author questions why government was not more careful in monitoring the progress of Bands towards self-determination. Could it be, he asks, that the government still does not care whether Indians survive as a distinct group or end up being assimilated?

Robbins, L.A. (Western Washington University): *Upper Skagit (Washington) and Gambell (Alaska) Indian Reorganization Act Governments: Struggles Without Constraints, Restraints and Power.*

The Upper Skagit and Gambell Eskimos are finding that economic prosperity is proving to be more elusive than once thought. Skagit victories over the recognition of treaty and fishing rights in 1974 led to optimism that economic prosperity was possible. The Gambell Eskimos were successful in preventing oil drilling in the Bering Sea, and when the *Alaska Native Claims Settlement Act*

came into effect, managed to gain some measure of control over their land based economy. However, both groups face the dilemma of limitations of power under governments set up by federal legislation rather than under terms of Aboriginal or Treaty Rights. Those groups are finding out that they do not have the sovereignty they require to capitalize on their development schemes, and that outside interference is slowly killing their dreams of economic and social self-sufficiency.

Jorgensen, J.G. (University of California, Irvine): *Sovereignty and the Structure of Dependency at Northern Ute*.

As an energy rich tribe, the Utes have found that real economic prosperity has eluded them despite the fact that they occupy oil-rich land. Their problems begin with abrogation of their sovereignty by the U.S. in the mid-nineteenth century, and can be traced to government interference with internal matters of land membership (enrollments), a matter which has caused severe internal factionalism. As well, interval political paralysis and an inability to gain control over the oil leases administered through the Bureau of Indian Affairs have resulted in a windfall for energy companies.

A. Blair Stonechild,  
Saskatchewan Indian Federated College,  
Regina, Saskatchewan,  
Canada, S4S 0A2.

## REFERENCE

Long, J. Anthony and Menno Boldt  
1988 *Governments in Conflict? Provinces and Indian Nations in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

McLean, Don.: *1885 Métis Rebellion or Government Conspiracy?*  
Winnipeg, Manitoba: Pemmican Publications Inc., 1985, ISBN  
0-919143-17-2, Illus., end notes, iv + 125 pp., paperback,  
\$12.95

Don McLean re-examines the causes of the 1885 Rebellion of focusing upon the connection between local politics in the Prince Albert area and national politics in Ottawa. Unfortunately he relies upon inference and apriori constructions to build his case against the government, because of the lack of direct evidence (p. 121). He asserts that Lawrence Clarke, a local politician, engineered the rebellion through a deal made with the federal government during a

February 1885 visit to Ottawa. The war was created by Clarke as a means of bringing prosperity to the clique of Conservative speculators in Prince Albert and by the federal government as a means of making it possible politically to get further funding for the bankrupt C.P.R. By today's standards claims McLean, these actions were dark and sinister, but given the limited political consciousness of the nineteenth century, as well as the position of the fledgling Canadian state "...as the administrator and mediator of the needs of the powerful industrialists and bankers, little else could be expected" (p 123).

McLean's purpose in writing the book was not only to establish a conspiracy theory of causation, but to unveil specifically Lawrence Clarke's role as the provocateur in the war of 1885. He chastizes current Canadian historical scholarship for failing to mention Clarke's activities which led to the fighting between the Métis and the police at Duck Lake. He specifically accuses George F. Stanley of relegating Clarke's role to a mere footnote (p.87).

This accusation is unfounded. A cursory glance at Stanley's *Birth of Western Canada*, reveals that Clarke is documented in some detail between pages 248-49, 253-54, and page 347. While on one hand McLean dismisses the bulk of Canadian historians on this issue, on the other hand he finds support for his thesis in the work of one turn of the century historian, Norman F. Black, who wrote a history of Saskatchewan and the Northwest Territories in 1913. McLean leans heavily on this one dated work and inferential analysis of period documents to support his thesis. This twin approach to his research leaves the book shallow in depth and lacking in credibility. If the explanations given by past and present historians fail to answer questions surrounding Clarke's role and federal government involvement in the rebellion, as Keith Goulet suggests in the book's Introduction, then readers will be disappointed to find that McLean's dogmatic rhetoric and conjectural analysis add little light to illuminate these issues with any certainty. Perhaps McLean's alienation from the historical consensus and methodology on this subject is derived from his training as a sociologist and a disposition as a social scientist toward deduction rather than historical induction.

The book is divided into nine chapters which treat the subject matter thematically. The first chapter assumes that some readers will not be familiar with the basic historical outline of the fur trade conducted by the Hudson's Bay Company. As a result, he attempts to sketch its history from 1670-1869 in nine pages. Chapter Two treats the rebellion of 1869 briefly and relies upon standard secondary works. Chapter Three, based almost exclusively on primary sources, explains the founding and legal-political operation of the community of St. Laurent in an informative and concise manner. Chapter Four explores the role of the N.W.M.P. in Métis territory and blames Lawrence Clarke for their presence in the Northwest due to his spreading of false rumors of an insurrection in 1875. This mono-casual approach to the presence of the N.W.M.P. is not convincing, given their assigned role in the national policy. Chapter Five docu-

ments the hardships the Métis endured and the petitions sent on their behalf to the federal government. McLean notes four distinct groups of people in the Northwest in the 1875 to 1885 period, each with its own set of grievances against the federal government. Unfortunately cultural, religious and class conflicts kept them apart.

Chapter Six, titled "Corruption in Prince Albert: The Failure of the Reform Movement" is a unique section of the book notable for its focus upon the dynamics of local nineteenth century politics in Prince Albert. Students of Canadian history familiar with the mythology of the terms "Family Compact" and "Chateaux Clique" will find many comparisons with "the clique" of Prince Albert (p. 64). According to McLean, the Métis voted as a block and did so on the instructions of one man, Father Andre. Lawrence Clarke and Father Andre are cast as the political kingmakers of the region. McLean makes several stereo-typical references to the Metis such as "ignorant farmers" and "simple folk", who were no match for the sophisticated and crafty members of the local Conservative political machine. Chapter Seven poses the idea that by 1884 the elite, comprised mostly of speculators, required a rebellion in order to stimulate the local economy while the federal government needed a "full scale" war to salvage the nation of Canada. McLean closes the chapter with Creighton's thesis that the success of the C.P.R. and the destruction of the Métis was coincidental. Chapter Eight is juxtaposed to the preceding chapter by Antithesis. In this chapter McLean cites a coded telegram as clear evidence pinpointing Clarke as the man responsible for the 1885 conflict. The document displayed on page 100 clearly shows only ambiguity of intent and expression. McLean was not able to cipher the code, only guess at it. His rhetoric at this point becomes too assertive and the impact of his argument becomes lost on the readers. The final chapter provides a stock account of the battle adding little that is new.

The major contribution of this book is not its critical perspective as intended, flawed as it is by weak evidence and inferential analysis, but its contribution, produced largely through the auspices of Chapter Six, to local history. McLean captures the ethos of nineteenth century local politics in Prince Albert and opens our understanding of its relationship to the rebellion.

Eric Bonfield,  
Department of History,  
Brandon University,  
Brandon, Manitoba,  
Canada, R7A 6A9.

Waldman, Carl; illustrations by Molly Braun: *Encyclopedia of Native American Tribes*, New York, Facts On File Publications, 1988, xiii + 293 pages, glossary, index, bibliography, 275 illustrations ISBN 0-8160-1421-3 Hard Cover (\$47.95 Can.)

Over the last twenty years, educators and historians have developed a renewed interest in the Indian people of North America. However the textbook portrayal of Indigenous people has been for the most part scandalous. Indians have often been described as being hostile savages, drunken or lazy. In general Indians have been depicted as the villains in the development of North America. The contributions, beliefs and values, diversity of cultural traits and languages of Indian people have been generally ignored.

Waldman makes a similar statement in his opening comments: "Often more is taught about cultures in other parts of the world than about Indian cultures. Students are more likely to know about the pyramids of Egypt than the pyramids of the Americas. Yet Native American history is central to the history of the Americas" (p.viii) This one volume *Encyclopedia of Native American Tribes* is an attempt to partially rectify incomplete, inaccurate information regarding the Indigenous peoples of North America.

Author Waldman, in claiming to be comprehensive, certainly gives broad coverage to the topic, although he falls far short in complete coverage. By the author's own admission "this book has space enough to cover only a selection of tribes. Hundreds more are not listed; South American tribes are not covered at all" (p. ix) and "yet there is more to the study of Algonquian religion that is a difficult subject to summarize in just a few paragraphs" (p. 12).

The book is designed in an encyclopedia format, listing Indian nations in alphabetical order. Within this structure such groupings as *Civilizations* and *Language Families* are incorporated. Each of these listings is cross-referenced in such a manner that the reader will soon begin to realize the complexity of lifestyles of North America's Aboriginal people.

To assist the reader in becoming familiar with terms which are used in the discipline of Indian Studies, A *Glossary* (p. 265-273) is integrated into this volume. For the novice, this addition will be useful when such words as *Atlatl*, *Chinampas*, *Coup*, *Holism*, *Kiva*, *Taiga*, *Tule*, and *Wickiup* need to be understood. However some words such as *Orenda*, *Wakanda*, and *Manitou* are incorrect. Specifically these words refer to special powers (natural and supernatural) which are found in all animate and inanimate objects and which have their own particular strengths. When proper prefixes or suffices are added to these three words, they then refer to the Creator or the Great Spirit.

There are inaccuracies in this volume of which readers must be aware. For example, the *Métis* (130-131) are a product of the meeting of two disparate groups — fur traders of European lineage and the women of various Indian nations such as Cree, Ojibwa, Huron, etc. rather than being one of the original Sub-Arctic cultural

groups. More accurately, the author should have placed this group in the section he labels *Other Categories* (p. xiii) rather than under the heading *Sub-arctic Culture*. The author does briefly explain how the Métis are a product of two cultures; then he focuses on the so-called rebellions of 1869-70 and 1885. Métis contributions to the development of Canada are more than just these examples of resistance.

More errors include the following. First, the *Red River* flows north into Lake Winnipeg rather than into the United States (p. 130). Second, the Métis declared themselves independent in order to join Canada as a distinctive group. The author continues by saying that Gabriel Dumont gained "some notoriety" (p.131) in the United States. Instead, the author could have used such words as "some fame", "some repute" or "some public esteem". By using the word, "notoriety" the author inadvertently continues to perpetuate the stereotyping of Native people whether they be Indian or Métis.

In other entries such as the *Chippewa (ojibwa)* (pp. 57-60), the *Potawatomi* (pp. 197-198), and the *Ottawa* (pp. 172-174) the author makes reference to "*The Council Of Three Tribes*" (p. 58). In actuality these nations are usually referred to as the *Council Of Three Fires*. In a further entry on the *Potawatomi* (pp. 197-198), the author translates their name to mean "people of the place of fire". In the language of the people, the proper meaning is "people who keep/make the fire". The third group of the Council, the *Ottawa*, (pp. 172-174), are in reality a specific group of the larger Ojibwa (Chippewa) nation. The author states that the group is identified by its main occupation, trading. Waldman makes a further error in stating that the Ottawa have no reservation lands in Ontario. In fact, they do continue to have reserve land on Manitoulin Island, Ontario.

One strong feature of this volume is the illustrations depicting many aspects of the complexity of Indian life which are difficult to express in words alone. The illustrations support the author's statement that "Indian cultural studies are especially difficult because of the great number of tribes and their many different ways of life" (p. 200). The illustrations will be an aid to breaking down stereotypical concepts regarding Indian people.

A second strong feature of the volume exists in the inclusion of eleven maps which show the locations of the Indian nations of North America. The maps show that there are a variety of nations which exist over the total area of North American, not just on the Prairie-Plains as stereotyped by western movies, although the cartographer may have inadvertently left out the location of the MODOC, a nation situated in Northern California.

In conclusion, this reviewer found this book, despite the identified errors and omissions, to be fairly well researched and well written. This volume should be considered only as a preliminary source of information regarding the study of North America's Indigenous peoples. The section *For Further Readings* (pp. 275-278) should be well used and lead the reader/learner to a more in-depth positive under-

standing of those of us who are called Indian, and to a greater recognition of our numerous contributions to the development of North America.

William Asikinack,  
Department of Indian Studies,  
Saskatchewan Indian Federated College,  
Regina, Saskatchewan,  
Canada, S4S 0A2.